

Submission deadline: Within one month after the end of the grant period (by the end of February)

政治研究結果報告書

Political Research Result Report

—政治研究助成 Political Research Grant—

2023年2月22日

一般財団法人 櫻田會 The Sakurada-kai Foundation

理事長 増田 勝彦 殿 President Katsuhiko Masuda

研究者 早稲田大学政治経済学部准教授

CHUNG, HUN

第40回（令和3年度）櫻田會政治研究助成による研究を下記のとおり実施しましたので、その結果について報告します。

※印の記入項目に関する貴會ホームページへの掲載についても同意いたします。

The following research was conducted under the Political Research Grant (FY 2022), and the results are reported as follows.

I agree that the information marked with an asterisk (*) will be posted on your website.

記

※研究の名称（英語も記入） *Research Theme

An Economic Defense of Utilitarianism from the Original Position

功利主義に対するロールズのオリジナルポジションからの経済的正当化

The original position together with the veil of ignorance have served as one of the main methodological devices to justify principles of distributive justice. Most approaches to this topic have primarily focused on the single person decision-theoretic aspect of the original position. This paper, in contrast, will directly model the basic structure and the economic agents therein to project the economic consequences and social outcomes generated either by utilitarianism or Rawls's two principles of justice. It will be shown that when the differences in people's productive abilities are sufficiently great, utilitarianism dominates Rawls's two principles of justice by providing a higher level of overall wellbeing to every member of society. Whenever this is the case, the parties can rely on the Principle of Dominance (which is a direct implication of instrumental rationality) to choose utilitarianism over Rawls's two principles of justice. Furthermore, when this is so, utilitarianism is free from one of its most fundamental criticisms that it "does not take seriously the distinction between persons." (Rawls 1971/1999: 24)

Paper Title: "When utilitarianism dominates justice as fairness: an economic defense of utilitarianism from the original position"

※英文抄録（研究目的、経過、成果 250 words 以内）

*Abstract (Purpose, Process, Significance- Within 250 words)

1. Write a research paper.
2. Present research paper in international and domestic conferences/workshops/seminars.
3. Publish research paper in an internationally respected journal.

All of the target objectives have been successfully achieved.

※研究の目的・研究方法・意義（和文 600 字以内）

*Purpose, Methods, and Significance of the Study (Within 300 words)

- Purpose: To analyze the two mainstream theories of distributive justice – Rawls’s two principles of justice and utilitarianism – by comparing their economic consequences.
- Methods: Careful textual reading and mathematical modeling.
- Significance of the Study: Many political philosophers commonly believe that utilitarianism, for the purpose of maximizing total social welfare, may generate extreme inequalities that sacrifice the interests of the least advantaged members of society, and, hence, Rawls’s two principles of justice better protects the interests of the least advantaged members of society than utilitarianism. My research paper demonstrates that this commonly held belief may be incorrect. Specifically, my research paper shows via a formal model that as long as the productive discrepancies among people are sufficiently great utilitarianism dominates Rawls’s two principle of justice by allowing everybody to enjoy a higher welfare level. This is a novel and significant contribution.

目的:分配的正義に関する2つの主流な理論、ロールズの正義の2原則と功利主義を、その経済的帰結を比較することによって分析すること。

方法:丁寧なテキスト読解と数学的モデリング。

本研究の意義:多くの政治哲学者は、社会的福利の最大化を目的とする功利主義は、社会的に最も恵まれない人々の利益を犠牲にする極端な不平等を生み出す可能性があり、それゆえ、ロールズの正義の二原則は功利主義よりも社会的に最も恵まれない人々の利益を守るのに優れていると一般に考えている。私の研究論文は、このような通説が誤りである可能性を示している。具体的には、人々の間の生産性の格差が十分に大きい限り、誰もがより高い福祉水準を享受できるようにすることで、功利主義がロールズの正義の二原則を支配することを、形式モデルを通じて明らかにするものである。これは斬新かつ重要な貢献である。

※研究経過と結果の概要 (以下の欄に 35 行以内(1500 字程度)にまとめる)

*Summary of Research Process and Result (Within 750 words)

My paper "When utilitarianism dominates justice as fairness: an economic defense of utilitarianism from the original position" has been accepted and published online (11 August 2022) in *Economics and Philosophy*. (*Economics and Philosophy* is the TOP 6 journal in the field of moral and/or political philosophy. According to: <https://leiterreports.typepad.com/blog/2022/08/specialist-journals-that-publish-the-best-articles-in-moral-andor-political-philosophy-the-results.html>)

私の論文「When utilitarianism dominates justice as fairness: an economic defense of utilitarianism from the original position」は *Economics and Philosophy* により 2022 年 8 月 11 日に受理され、オンラインで発表されました。(次のリンクによると、*Economics and Philosophy* 誌は道徳哲学や政治哲学の分野でトップ 6 に入る学術誌です: <https://leiterreports.typepad.com/blog/2022/08/specialist-journals-that-publish-the-best-articles-in-moral-andor-political-philosophy-the-results.html>)

In the Acknowledgements section, I have written:

Acknowledgements

This research has been generously funded by the 40th Sakurada-kai Political Science Research Grant (No. 16) 櫻田會「政治研究助成(助第 40-16 号)」.

The published paper can be accessed by the following link:

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0266267122000098>

※研究成果の発表・著書、論文、学会報告等 (あるいは発表の計画や形式等)

*Publications, books, papers, conference reports, etc. (or plan and style of presentation)

Here is the list of the conferences/workshop/seminars that I have presented by research.

2023

[Invited] Seminar in Political Philosophy (Professor Akira Inoue), U. of Tokyo (Jan 11, 2023)

2022

[Invited] "Uses of Formal Theory" Workshop, University of Chicago (Oct 27-28, 2022)

[Invited] Nozick's Anarchy, State, and Utopia at 50 Conference, University of Fribourg, Switzerland (Sep 15-16, 2022)

[Invited] Faculty Workshop, FPSE, Waseda University (July 20, 2022)

[Invited] SGU Global Asia Research Center Lunch Meeting, Waseda University (July 5, 2022)

〔注〕 文責は貴研究グループに負っていただきます。個人情報等には十分ご注意ください

(Notice) Your research group is responsible for the content of this document. Please be careful with personal information.